



Introduction:

Facilitator: The factors contributing to trafficking in women are varied and complex, differing from country to country. In order to establish what factors make women vulnerable to trafficking, it is necessary not only to consider global and regional social and economic changes, but also to conduct a local-level analysis of country conditions in source countries for trafficking. During this session we will explore factors that contribute to trafficking broadly as well as focus on the importance of factors that create situations conducive to trafficking in women in the CEE/CIS region. We will also examine recent trends in trafficking patterns and common trafficking routes in the CEE/CIS region.

Learning Objectives:

Facilitator: At the end of this session, participants will be able to:

- Analyze reasons for female migration and common stereotypes that are associated with it.
- Identify the general and regionally specific factors contributing to trafficking in women.
- Identify and discuss recent trends in trafficking patterns.
- Identify trafficking routes and mechanisms.

Activity 1: Exploring Factors Contributing to Trafficking in Women

- 1. Facilitator divides participants into small groups of 3 to 4 persons each, hands out to each group a flipchart sheet and a marker and gives them the following task:
 - In your groups, brainstorm possible answers for the following questions:
 - > Why do women migrate abroad?
 - > How are women and girls recruited?
 - > Who is involved and has control over this process?
 - Record you ideas on the flipchart sheet. You will have 7-9 minutes to complete the task, after which you will report to the entire group.
- 2. After 7-9 minutes, facilitator reconvenes the entire group and has a volunteer representative from each small group report the results of the brainstorming activity in their respective group.
 - After each group's presentation, post the flipchart sheets on the wall so that participants can refer to them throughout the rest of the session.
- 3. Facilitator summarizes the results of the brainstorming and leads a group discussion using the following questions to guide the group:
 - Legitimate reasons for women's migration abroad include seeking employment opportunities, earning money to help family members, traveling, visiting a friend or relative, etc. Then why do

many women find themselves in situations where they are exploited and become victims of trafficking?

- > What are the stereotypes that contribute to migration and illegal employment of women abroad?
 - If necessary, offer examples of stereotypes to help participants during discussion, e.g. an illegal job abroad is acceptable, all women know what lies in store for them abroad (i.e. all women understand that they will provide sex services abroad), people we know, like neighbors, friends and acquaintances cannot be traffickers, traffickers are always strangers, traffickers are mostly men etc.
- > Why are women and girls vulnerable to being trafficked?
- 4. Facilitator gives a mini-lecture on factors contributing to trafficking emphasizing the following ideas:
 - Usually, it is a combination of factors that push women and girls into situations in which they are exploited and become victims of trafficking. The factors that play a role in trafficking are interdependent and interconnected. Furthermore, they vary according to region and context. Still some issues can be outlined and some generalizations can be made which may help to understand the root causes and contributing factors to trafficking in women.
 - The various factors that contribute to trafficking are sometimes caracterized as "supply side" factors, such as gender-based discrimination and feminization of poverty, and "demand side" factors, such as women's perceived suitability for work in the informal sector and labor-intensitve producion, and increased demand for foreign workers.
 - Some factors, such as corruption or armed conflict, do not fit neatly into either the "demand" or "supply" side of trafficking, but nevertheless contribute to this problem in some regions.
 - Globally, the rapid economic changes brought about through globalization, such as reduction or removal of trade barriers, assistance and encouragement of free movement of goods around the world and the deregulation and privatization of economies have had a considerable impact on the growth of traffikcing in women in recent years.
 - In the CEE/CIS region, most countries have recently experienced severe economic and social decline. The combined effects of transition from conflict to post conflict situations, the presence of the international community and peace keeping forces, and the transition from state to market economies have intensified inequalities in economic and social spheres. Lack of the rule of law and difficult economic situations have allowed black market economies to flourish.
 - The reality of the post conflict situation and economic transition have weakened the position of women in the labor market, causing more women to be unemployed and the feminization of poverty, which in turn has resulted in increased migration especially among younger women.
 - The root causes of migration and vulnerability to trafficking include not only the weak economic situation of women, but also increasing trends such as discrimination against women in their countries of origin, violence against women, the contradiction between their lower position in the family and their responsibility for the family well-being, their virtual lack of influence in public/political life and their exclusion from decision-making processes.
 - During the exercise that we will conduct next, you will have an opportunity to explore some of the factors contributing to trafficking in women in greater depth.
- Facilitator forms small groups of 4-6 participants, distributes to each group <u>Handout A</u>: Factors Contributing to Trafficking in Women, <u>Handout B</u>: Case Study, flipchart sheets and markers and gives them the following task:
 - Study the information on the factors contributing to trafficking in women, presented in Handout A.
 - Read the Case Study from Handout B and discuss in you group which factors contributed to trafficking in this particular case.

- Record you conclusions on the flipchart sheet. You will have 30 minutes to complete the task, after which you will report to the entire group.
 - As participants work on the task, move from group to group and help clarify their task without resolving the issue for them.
- After 30 minutes facilitator reconvenes the entire group has each small group report their results using the following process:
 - a. Ask a representative from each group to post their flipchart sheets on the wall next to each other, and to comment on the results of their group's discussion, taking turns.
 - b. Note differences and similarities in the answers presented by different groups.
 - c. Lead a brief discussion about the group's conclusion.
- 6. Facilitator closes the exercise by emphasizing that the case study shows that factors combine to push women to take high risks in searching for better opportunities abroad. Obviously, there is no single factor; it is problematic to isolate factors clearly from one another as 'X' caused 'Y'.

Activity 2: Trafficking Mechanisms And Trends

- 1. Facilitator introduces the exercise, highlighting the following ideas:
 - Due to its transnational nature, trafficking impacts every country at some level. The United Nations Development Fund for Women (UNIFEM) points out the following trends in trafficking patterns:



Prior to the exercise, prepare a flipchart listing trends in trafficking and post it on the wall, so that participants can refer to it during the mini-lecture.

Trends in Trafficking Patterns

- ✓ Growing scope and magnitude
- ✓ Occurring through small scale informal networks as well as well organized international criminal networks
- ✓ Newer source, destination and transit sites
- ✓ Diverse and sophisticated mechanisms
- ✓ Varied purposes
- ✓ Changes in the profile of trafficked persons
- ✓ Extended linkages between trafficking networks and sectors of the crime industry and business
- ✓ Underground nature of trafficking networks that puts them out of reach of the legal system
- Strong connections between trafficking networks and political networks
- ✓ Increased following of migration routes and patterns
- Increasing profits with little or no risk
- ✓ Gross human rights violations for capital accumulation
- Facilitated by advances in transport, information and communications technologies, particularly by internet

Adapted from: Trafficking in Persons: A Gender Rights Perspective, UNIFEM Briefing Kit, October 2002. Available at: http://www.unifem-eseasia.org/Resources/Traffick2.html

- Organizations that study migration patterns and trafficking classify countries as either "source," "transit" or "destination." In simple terms, the country of origin of a trafficking victim, the country where traffickers recruit women and girls, is known as a source country. Traffickers frequently move women through intermediary countries, often for extended periods when the women may be forced to work. These countries are known as transit countries. Traffickers chose transit countries based on their geographical location (near a border or a port), their weak border controls, corruption of immigration officials or their affiliation with the organized crime groups that are involved in the trafficking. Transit countries generally have access to the destination country. Destination countries are those that receive trafficking victims. Destination countries are generally economically prosperous because they must be able to support the commercial sex industry.
- The classifications become complicated because many countries fit more than one category; they may serve as transit counties along a trafficking route and may also receive trafficking victims as a destination.
- Routes of trafficking are designed and manipulated by traffickers. It is therefore inaccurate to say
 that women are always trafficked from underdeveloped to more developed countries. Trafficking
 increasingly occurs between and within developing countries. Often women are trafficked from
 countries where there are economic, environmental or political problems, to countries or regions
 where the apparent quality of life for the average person is higher.
- The International Organization for Migration (IOM) Kosovo Counter Trafficking Unit Situation Report points out the following trafficking routes in the CEE/CIS region, particularly Balkan countries (*report available from* http://www.iom.int//DOCUMENTS/PUBLICATION/EN/Kosovo_sit_report.pdf):
 - As source countries/regions: women from Balkan countries are mostly trafficked within the region and to Western Europe. IOM has assisted victims trafficked for sexual exploitation from Albania to Italy, from Romania or Bulgaria to Kosovo.
 - As transit countries/regions: traffickers transfer victims from Eastern to Western Europe passing through the Balkans, especially via Bosnia, Albania and Serbia.
 - As destination countries/regions: many Balkan countries become attractive destinations for trafficking. Thousands of women and children from Eastern Europe are trafficked to Macedonia, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Kosovo and Albania.
- According to the report Trafficking in Human Beings in Southeastern Europe by UNICEF/UNOHCHR/OSCE – ODIHR, June 2002, "...the trafficking routes [in the region] run from Moldova, Ukraine and other former Soviet Republics – the main countries of origin – via Romania, which is also one of the major countries of origin, and Bulgaria to the countries of the former Yugoslavia, Italy, Turkey, Greece and Western Europe. Women usually cross borders in groups, organized by traffickers, usually using mixed channels, legal and illegal." (report available from: http://www.unicef.org/sexual-exploitation/trafficking-see.pdf)
 - At this point you may wish to include examples from other sources that illustrate trafficking patterns between source, transit and destination countries in the region, such as maps of trafficking routes created by the Protection Project, available at: http://www.protectionproject.org/main1.htm
 - It is advisable to reinforce the above material through small group discussions of the news articles from the internet sources or local media illustrating trafficking trends, mechanisms and routes. Prepare the portfolio of news articles or clippings prior to the exercise. See <u>Information</u> <u>for Facilitators</u> for ideas on the materials to include.

Summary and Closing:

Facilitator closes emphasizing the following points:

• The factors promoting female migration and contributing to women's vulnerability to trafficking are varied and complex. They are interdependent and interconnected, and combine to create environments conducive to trafficking in women.

- Traffickers frequently vary trafficking routes to take advantage of regional instabilities. Trafficking routes do not necessarily flow only from underdeveloped to developed countries, but women are often moved between and within developing countries.
- Recent trends in trafficking patterns illustrate that the nature of the problem is changing and that it is difficult to make generalizations about how traffickers operate and who is at risk for trafficking. At the same time, it is clear that traffickers are sophisticated and adaptable to changing circumstances. Thus, effective anti-trafficking initiatives should be responsive to local and regional changes in trafficking patterns.

Questions and Comments:

Facilitator should end the session by asking if there are remaining questions or comments related to this material. Keeping track of feedback will allow the facilitator to make useful changes to future presentations.

Copyright © 2003 Minnesota Advocates for Human Rights; available from http://www.stopvaw.org. Permission is granted to use this material for non-commercial purposes. Please use proper attribution



HANDOUT A

Factors Contributing to Trafficking in Women

Factors contributing to supply	Factors contributing to demand
 Lack of legitimate and fulfilling employment opportunities, particularly in rural communities. In the CEE/CIS region, while there is tremendous variation in how individual countries in this region have experienced the economic transition, women have been negatively impacted by high unemployment rates and the loss of social programs that existed in the past. For many women in post-Soviet countries, the transition has meant they are less economically independent than they were previously. Feminization of migration, and inadequate access to information on migration/job opportunities, recruitment channels, and risks associated with female migration. After the disintegration of the Soviet Union, new opportunities to travel, study and work abroad arose for women in the CEE/CIS region. At the same time, economic transition has been especially hard on women. Poverty as well as other factors, such as a desire to travel, compel many women to look abroad in search of better lives. Many women attempt to explore the world through employment agencies or study abroad programs, without knowing whether the agencies are legitimate. Gender-based discrimination is a pervasive reason why women make up the majority of persons who are trafficked. Gender-based discrimination is embedded in all institutions of society in general, and particularly in the structure of the labor market and the job opportunities available to women. In the employment setting, women are often the first fired and last hired. Women also disproportionately experience sexual harassment in the workplace. This situation forces many women to look abroad for work and makes them particularly vulnerable to exploitation. Research suggests that victims of domestic violence and other forms of gender-based violence may also be at risk to become victims of trafficking when they seek work abroad in order to leave the abusive situation. 	 Women's perceived suitability for work in the rapidly growing informal sector which is characterized by low wages, casual employment, hazardous work conditions and the absence of collective bargaining mechanisms. Generally, women have become more vulnerable and subject to abusive working conditions, because these marginalized and unregulated areas of work are not visible, and thus not subject to labor laws and regulation. The growing demand for foreign workers for domestic and care-giving roles, and lack of adequate corresponding regulations. The lucrative nature of trafficking Trafficking has become a significant source of income for organized crime enterprises. Traffickers profit from the "sale" of the trafficking victim and also exploit the women themselves. The fact that criminal enterprises conduct much of their recruitment activities through legitimate front businesses, for example newspaper advertising, local travel agencies or visa services, makes it difficult to track who is conducting the illegal activity. The low riskhigh profit nature of trafficking is encouraged by a lack of will on the part of enforcement agencies to prosecute traffickers, including owners/managers of institutions into which persons are trafficked. The transnational and highly-organized criminal dimensions of trafficking make it unique from other forms of violence against women. Demand for women's sexual services and the growth of the billion-dollar sex entertainment industry. The trafficking of women into the commercial sex industry is primarily to countries in which prostitution and the provision of other sexual services are either tolerated or legal. The promotion of sex tourism as a development strategy has also contributed to voluntary migration for sex work; however the fact that sex work is illegal for migrants in most countries increases the risk of trafficking for migrant sex workers. Lack of access to legal redress or rememdies, for victims of tr
tolerate violence against women.	 The ease in controlling and manipulating vulnerable women.

Factors Contributing to Both Supply and Demand

Conflict Zones and Militarization

In situations of armed conflict women are especially vulnerable to sexual abuse and forced domestic service by armed forces. In some cases women are forced into prostitution when rape is used as a weapon of war by enemy soldiers. Conflict and the resulting instability weaken border controls and facilitate the movement of women from country to country. The lack of viable legal means for migration pushes women into taking great risks in seeking jobs abroad, making them more vulnerable to being trafficked.

The stationing of troops in both conflict and post-conflict areas is often followed by the development of the sex industry. This phenomenon has been consistently recognized during war. Victims of trafficking are sometimes delivered to brothels that serve military bases. Military involvement in trafficking and prostitution ranges from ignoring the problem and failing to discipline troops to actual regulation of the sex trade.

Government policies and practices that may facilitate trafficking

Often governments lack legislation on trafficking or existing regulations may be out-dated and thus ineffective in addressing the problem, particularly in the case of trafficking perpetrated by transnational crime rings.

Weak border controls and untrained immigration officials make it possible for victims of trafficking to be transported both through transit countries and to destination countries without detection. On the other hand, restrictive emigration policies/laws, instituted often as a "protective" measure, and strict entry requirements limit women's legitimate migration. Most legal channels of migration offer opportunities in typically male-dominated sectors (construction and agriculture work).

In extreme cases, individual government officials, such as border guards, police officers, court officials, participate in or benefit directly from trafficking. Government corruption may take the form of receiving bribes from traffickers or profits from the trafficking industry, cooperation with traffickers or refusing to provide trafficking victims with assistance.

Sources:

Human Rights and Trafficking in Persons: A Handbook, Global Alliance Against Trafficking in Women, 2001.

Trafficking in Persons: A Gender Rights Perspective, UNIFEM Briefing Kit, October 2002, *available at:* http://www.unifem-eseasia.org/Resources/Traffick2.html

Trafficking in Human Beings in Southeastern Europe, UNICEF/UNOHCHR/OSCE – ODIHR, June 2002, available at http://www.unicef.org/sexual-exploitation/trafficking-see.pdf

A Resource Book for Working Against Trafficking in Women and Girls. Baltic Sea Region". Kvinnaforum, Stockholm, February 2002, 3rd Edition.

Copyright © 2003 Minnesota Advocates for Human Rights; available from http://www.stopvaw.org. Permission is granted to use this material for non-commercial purposes. Please use proper attribution.



HANDOUT B

Case Study

Armine, aged 26, lived in Yerevan, Armenia. She and her husband had divorced eight months earlier, leaving Armine to care for their 2-year old daughter alone. Her parents and close family live in Vanadzor, so when her daughter was born, Armine left her job to take care of her child. After the divorce, Armine found a job as a receptionist with a telecommunications business. For a few months, Armine was content with her work, but one day when she was working late her boss suggested that she join him for dinner. During the meal, he proposed that she spend the night with him. Armine refused, and when she returned to work, her employer began to pressure her to spend time outside of work with him. After she made many excuses not to stay late in the office, Armine's boss made clear that she would be fired if she did not agree to sleep with him. Armine felt that she had no choice but to quit her job.

After looking for work for in a number of private firms, Armine was unsuccessful and discouraged. She did not have the computer skills necessary for many jobs and did not speak English as well as some of the other applicants. Finally, Armine took a job as a waitress in a café, but was barely earning enough to support herself and her child. Not long afterwards, the café went out of business. A few days later, however, Armine ran into a woman that she recognized from working in the café. The woman told Armine that she was planning a trip to Dubai, and that Armine should consider looking for a job in a restaurant or bar there. The woman told her that there were many fancy clubs in the United Arab Emirates, with wealthy customers. Armine explained that she was not interested in working as a dancer or stripper in a club, but the woman assured her that even waitresses can earn large tips in addition to their salaries and she would not have to do any work that made her uncomfortable. Armine agreed to meet with the woman in a few days but still had some reservations about traveling abroad for work. Not long afterwards, however, Armine was discussing her plans with a neighbor. The neighbor told her that she knew of a friend who had gone to Dubai to clean houses and had been recruited through an employment agency in Yerevan. Hearing that a local company was in the business of helping women to find work in the United Arab Emirates reassured Armine that there must be legitimate opportunities for work abroad and she felt more confident about her decision.

Armine met again with the woman from the café and was introduced to two other women who said they were also planning to travel to Dubai for work in restaurants or housecleaning. Armine could not pay the full price for her ticket, but the woman who was organizing the trip said that she would take care of the travel documents and airfare. In a few days, the group met again, and Armine was given a ticket and a valid visitors visa. The group traveled directly from Yerevan and when they arrived in the Dubai airport, it seemed that all the officials, the police, border guards and customs officials, knew the woman who organized the trip. As a result, the group passed through immigration quickly and none of their documents were carefully checked.

Armine and the other women were taken to a hotel in the city where the organizer asked for their passports. She told them that she needed to give their documents to the hotel receptionist to register them. The women stayed in the hotel for three days and because the country and language were unfamiliar, they rarely left the room. On the fourth day, the organizer returned with a local man. She told the women that they must move to a less expensive hotel, but she never returned their documents. She also told the women that they must begin earning money to repay their debts and that they would soon be sent "clients." The local man, who she introduced to them, would come and collect the money they earned. When Armine protested, the recruiter told her that she could arrange to have someone in Armenia hurt her daughter or family. In addition, the organizer told the women that there was no point in trying to leave since neither the police not immigration officials would help them.

In fact, Armine did not know that foreign nationals comprise about 85% of the population of the United Arab Emirates, and guest workers make up 98% of the country's private sector workforce. The United Arab Emirates has no laws prohibiting the trafficking of persons, but that it has restricted granting visas to single women under the age of forty to prohibit them from visiting and working as prostitutes.

Based on case studies from *Trafficking in Women and Children from the Republic of Armenia: A Study*, International Organization for Migration, September 2001, *available at* http://www.iom.int//DOCUMENTS/PUBLICATION/EN/Armenia_traff_report.pdf and information from *Trafficking in Persons Report*, Country Narratives, U.S. Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons, June 2002 *available at* http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2002/.

Copyright © 2003 Minnesota Advocates for Human Rights; available from http://www.stopvaw.org. Permission is granted to use this material for non-commercial purposes. Please use proper attribution.

INFORMATION FOR FACILITATORS

Below are a few sample news articles that illustrate some of the current trends in trafficking in the CEE/CIS region. Such articles are widely available through internet news sources and local media.

From Hotel Macedonia, Laura Rozen, Ms. Magazine, posted on the internet Tuesday, August 14, 2001.

"Like guns, narcotics, and cigarettes, the trafficking of women is a growing business in Macedonia, which sits among the impoverished factory towns of countries in Eastern Europe, just beyond the lure of Western European prosperity. Last year, government authorities detained more than a thousand undocumented migrants a month, the majority of them Eastern European women forced to sell sex in the dozens of bars, motels, and nightclubs that have sprouted up along the highways and in the villages of Macedonia.

'Criminal networks are increasingly using Macedonia as a final destination for trafficked sex workers,' says Martin Wyss, director of the Macedonian office of the [International Organization for Migration] . . .

'The same guys running the bars using trafficked women are the same ones running drugs and guns,' Wyss adds. ...

The dramatic rise in the number of trafficked women throughout Macedonia coincides with the arrival of some fortyfive thousand so-called peacekeeping troops to the region, in the wake of the NATO bombing of Yugoslavia two years ago. Kosovo sits about twelve miles north of the Macedonian capital, where many of the NATO-led troops and other international staff come to relax on the weekends. "Interest in the prostitution business went up after the soldiers came to Kosovo," says Stojkovski. 'On the weekends, they flood the brothels in Macedonia.' "

From *Caucasus: Poor Laws Aid Groups Trafficking Women*, Jean-Christophe Peuch, RFE/RL, July 27 2001, *available from* http://women3rdworld.about.com/mbody.htm

"The [International Organization for Migration] IOM's project director in Baku, Gulya Tagiyeva, tells RFE/RL a lack of border controls between Azerbaijan and Turkey makes things easier for criminal gangs. The Azerbaijani exclave of Nakhichevan, which borders Armenia, Iran, and Turkey, is one of the preferred crossing points for traffickers.

'To enter Turkey from Nakhichevan is simple. Passports are almost never [thoroughly] checked. All you have to do [to cross the nine-kilometer border with Turkey] is show your passport, pay \$10, and you are immediately issued an entry visa. There is absolutely no strict border regime. You don't have to apply for a visa in advance. The migration flow between Nakhichevan and Turkey is very important. Men go from there to Turkey to work as seasonal workers. Border traffic there is very active.' "

From Trafficking in Central Asian Women: The Rise in Vice, The Economist, June 14 2001

"The number of Central Asian women going abroad to work as prostitutes is on the increase. In Russia and the former communist countries of Eastern Europe, most women are probably aware that the promise of a well-paid job as a waitress or dancer in a West European country may simply be a ruse to entice them into prostitution. But in post-Soviet Central Asia, where authoritarian governments try to control their Citizens' knowledge of the world, not everyone is so sophisticated.

The International Organization for Migration estimates that up to 4,000 women were recruited into prostitution abroad from Kyrgyzstan in 1999, and 1,000 women from Tajikistan in 2000.

The main destinations for Central Asian women are the United Arab Emirates and Turkey, with which the mostly Turkic-speaking countries in the region have cultural and economic ties. But there is also trafficking between the five republics."

From White Slaver Gets Stiff Sentence, Nina Gilbert And Itim, The Jerusalem Post, January 17 2002 at 4.

"MK Zehava Gal-On (Meretz), who heads the Knesset committee of inquiry into trafficking in women, said . . .the committee has thus far determined that the war on trafficking in women is being hampered by lenient court sentences. The committee yesterday discussed the role newspapers play in encouraging this trafficking, since they run advertisements for escort services and massage parlors. Gal-On said there is "no doubt a connection" between the advertising and trafficking.

A State Attorney's Office representative informed the committee that the ads in the format they now appear are illegal."

From Yugoslavia: First-Ever Anti-Trafficking Law Drafted To Fight Sex-Slave Trade, Alexandra Poolos, Radio Free Europe/ Radio Liberty, 9 May 2002.

"Local police and border officials often work closely with criminal gangs, so women trapped as sex slaves have little chance to escape their servitude.

Jelena Bjelica is a Serbian journalist who has been following the Balkan trafficking route for close to a year. She says that the trafficking of women earns smugglers "quick and easy money" with almost none of the risk involved in moving other "goods," like guns or drugs.

'We are speaking, of course, about the organized criminal network. They are regional, international. And this type of organized crime [human trafficking], is much cheaper and much safer than trafficking in drugs and weapons. You have a woman you smuggle across the border. There is no danger of having your goods confiscated,' Bjelica said.

Yugoslavia is not just a country of transit for traffickers. It also serves as a final destination and a country of origin. Like many other countries in the region, Yugoslavia suffers from a severely depressed economy that has left many women desperate for any opportunity to work abroad."

Copyright © 2003 Minnesota Advocates for Human Rights; available from http://www.stopvaw.org. Permission is granted to use this material for non-commercial purposes. Please use proper attribution.